



Topic Exploration Report

Topic explorations are designed to provide a high-level briefing on new topics submitted for consideration by Health Technology Wales. The main objectives of this report are to:

- Determine the quantity of evidence available for a technology of interest.
- Identify any gaps in the evidence.
- Inform decisions on topics that warrant fuller assessment by Health Technology Wales (HTW).

Topic exploration report number:	TER348
Topic:	Video feedback interventions to improve communication within family relationships and support children at risk
Summary of findings:	<p>Child maltreatment has a profound impact on children's wellbeing and can have long-term effects on the child's social, emotional, and cognitive development. Video feedback interventions use a relationship-based approach to improve child-parent communication and relationships. It is suggested that their use can lead to positive outcomes on child development, parenting skills and overall communication between all parties involved. The details of video feedback interventions can vary but specific programmes, such as video interaction guidance, are available.</p> <p>National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE) public health guideline (PH40) on social and emotional wellbeing in early years recommends video interaction guidance as an evidence-based intervention for vulnerable children and their families. The NICE guideline (NG26) on children's attachment for children at young people who are adopted, in care or at high risk of going into care also recommends video interaction guidance for some populations.</p> <p>This topic exploration report summarises evidence on the effectiveness of video feedback interventions to educate parents with children at risk. We identified one systematic review with meta-analysis and two additional individual studies published since the systematic review. In addition, we identified one service evaluation of a video interaction guidance service that is currently being provided in the UK. These varied in their overall objectives, types of video feedback intervention and comparators. The identified systematic reviews and two individual studies of video feedback interventions demonstrated potential benefits for children at risk and their parent(s).</p>

Introduction and aims

Child maltreatment has a profound impact on children's wellbeing and can have lifelong effects on the child's social, emotional, and cognitive development (Vizard et al. 2022). Child maltreatment refers to a person under the age of 18 that is either harmed or not properly attended to its needs. There are four main forms of child maltreatment: (1) physical abuse, (2) sexual abuse, (3) emotional abuse, (4) neglect and (5) witnessing family violence (Vizard et al. 2022). Children might experience more than one form of parental maltreatment.

Since early childhood is vital for the child's development, effective interventions to improve parent-child relationships and prevent child maltreatment are needed. Video-feedback interventions use a relationship-based approach to improve the child-parent communication and relationship (Dodsworth et al. 2021). During this approach, parents are asked to observe, analyse, and reflect on selected video interactions with their children and to work with a professional to develop ways of improving relationships and avoid maladaptive parenting techniques. It has been suggested that video feedback interventions are associated with positive outcomes on overall child development, while also improving parenting skills, reducing parental stress, and increasing parental enjoyment (Doria et al. 2014, Landor & Kennedy 2011).

Health Technology Wales researchers searched for evidence on the effectiveness and cost effectiveness of video-feedback interventions for parenting education to support children at risk.

Evidence overview

Guidance

The National Institute for the Health and Care Excellence (NICE) has previously published a public health guideline (PH40) on social and emotional wellbeing in early years (NICE 2012). PH40 recommends that VIG is considered by health visitors and midwives who visit vulnerable children and their families, especially for improvements on maternal sensitivity and infant-mother attachment. In addition, there is a NICE guideline (NG26) on children's attachment for children at young people who are adopted, in care or at high risk of going into care (NICE 2015). This guideline recommends VIG for preschool-age children with, or at risk of, attachment difficulties and preschool-age children in the care system, subject to special guardianship orders and adopted from care (NICE 2015). However, it does not make this recommendation for children who have been, or at risk of, being maltreated. NG26 is supported by an NIHR-funded systematic review and meta-analysis (Wright et al. 2015) that included seven studies on VIG. They report that intervention using video feedback interventions appeared to improve attachment compared to standard care (OR= 1.62, 95%CI 1.00 to 2.60, p = 0.05). This review also included an economic evaluation, but this does not comment on the cost-effectiveness of video feedback interventions specifically.

Systematic reviews

We identified one systematic review focusing on video feedback interventions for children at risk.

Gubbels et al. (2021) conducted a systematic review with meta-analysis examining moderators of the effectiveness of home visiting programmes for preventing child maltreatment. The review aimed to identify randomised controlled trials, and quasi-experimental and observational designs and included 77 studies. Of these, five studies used video feedback approaches. The review reports that programmes using video-feedback interventions were associated with lower levels of child maltreatment and these interventions had larger effects (Cohen's d= 0.397) compared to programmes not using video-feedback intervention (Cohen's d= 0.124).

Individual Studies

We identified one randomised controlled trial (RCT) (Cyr et al. 2020) examining video-feedback interventions for children at risk and their parents that have been published since the search in Gubbels et al. (2021). We also

identified one evaluation of delivery of VIG in England and due to the setting was considered relevant to report here (Whalley & Williams 2015).

Cyr et al. (2020) conducted a RCT to evaluate the effectiveness of a video feedback intervention in improving parent-child relationships and professional decision-making prior to placement decisions by children's services. The study was based in Quebec, Canada and recruited 69 parents in contact with children's services due to substantiated reports of child maltreatment. Parents were randomised to receive video feedback or a psychoeducational intervention as part of an assessment to inform to placement decisions made by a judge. The study reports that families receiving video feedback had greater increases in interaction quality at follow-up compared to control. In addition, the study reports that professional's assessment of risk of further maltreatment was more accurate for families receiving video feedback than for other families. In a further paper, van der Asdonk et al. (2021) completed further analysis of this trial exploring whether effects were moderate by parental childhood trauma. They report that there is some evidence that where parents have more severe levels of childhood trauma, interventions may be less effective. For this group, other approaches may be needed.

We also identified a National Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Children (NSPCC) impact evaluation of VIG services offered to parents where initial concerns of possible neglect in children have been identified in England (Whalley & Williams 2015). The evaluation used a before-and-after design, comparing three measures completed by parents at the start and end of the VIG programme for children between two and eleven years old that were at risk of possible neglect but not subject to a child protection plan. The service was offered at seven centres across England, Scotland, Wales and Northern Ireland. Whalley & Williams (2015) reported statistically significant changes associated with (1) challenging behaviours (e.g., temper tantrums), (2) emotional symptoms (e.g., fears), (3) hyperactivity (e.g., fidgeting) and (4) pro-social strengths (e.g., sharing). They also reported statistically significant reductions in (1) laxness, (2) over-reactivity (i.e., harsh disciplinary strategies) and (3) verbosity (i.e., ineffective long verbal exchanges). By the end of the VIG intervention, Whalley & Williams (2015) concluded that there were significant changes on the interactional strategies used by the parents and on the child-parent relationship, especially on parental support, involvement and overall communication.

Economic evaluations

No further relevant economic evaluations focusing on the use of video-feedback interventions to support children at risk were identified.

Areas of uncertainty

Based on the identified evidence, some areas of uncertainty remain to be clarified. These include:

- Video feedback interventions have been trialled in a range of populations. This review focused on a broad definition of children at risk and a more in-depth review would be needed to explore whether there are specific populations in Wales who would particularly benefit.
- Studies appeared to use a variety of video feedback intervention approaches and it is unclear whether there are differences in effectiveness of these interventions.
- Most identified studies were completed in settings outside of the United Kingdom and there are likely to be differences in delivery of children's services across these settings. A more in-depth review would be needed to assess how generalisable findings are to Wales.
- Guidelines on video feedback interventions were identified and VIG appears to be available in some areas of England and sites within Wales were included within the NSPCC evaluation. However, it is unclear the extent to which these services are currently available in Wales

Literature search results

Health technology assessments and guidance

NICE. (2012). Social and emotional wellbeing: early years. Public health guideline PH40. National Institute for Health and Care Excellence. Available at: <https://www.nice.org.uk/guidance/ph40> [Accessed 18 Mar 2022].

NICE. (2015). Children's attachment: attachment in children and young people who are adopted from care, in care or at high risk of going into care. NICE guideline NG26. Available at: <https://www.nice.org.uk/guidance/ng26> [Accessed 18 Mar 2022].

Evidence reviews and economic evaluations

Gubbels J, van der Put CE, Stams GJM, et al. (2021). Components associated with the effect of home visiting programs on child maltreatment: a meta-analytic review. *Child Abuse Negl.* 114: 104981. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chiabu.2021.104981>

Wright B, Barry M, Hughes E, et al. (2015). Clinical effectiveness and cost-effectiveness of parenting interventions for children with severe attachment problems: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Health technology assessment (Winchester, England)*. 19(52): vii-xxviii, 1-347. doi: <https://doi.org/10.3310/hta19520>

Individual studies

Cyr C, Dubois-Comtois K, Paquette D, et al. (2020). An attachment-based parental capacity assessment to orient decision-making in child protection cases: a randomized control trial. *Child Maltreatment*. 27(1): 66-77. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1177/1077559520967995>

van der Asdonk S, Cyr C, Alink L. (2021). Improving parent-child interactions in maltreating families with the Attachment Video-feedback Intervention: parental childhood trauma as a moderator of treatment effects. *Attachment and Human Development*. 23(6): 876-96. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1080/14616734.2020.1799047>

Whalley P, Williams M. (2015). *Child neglect and Video Interaction Guidance: key findings and executive summary of an NSPCC service offered to parents where initial concerns of neglect have been noted*, London, National Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Children.

References used in 'Introduction and aims' section

Dodsworth E, Kelly C, Bond C. (2021). Video interaction guidance with families: a systematic review of the research. *Educational & Child Psychology*. 38(3): 48-61.

Doria M, Kennedy H, Strathie C, et al. (2014). Explanations for the Success of Video Interaction Guidance (VIG): An Emerging Method in Family Psychotherapy. *The Family Journal*. 22(1): 78-87. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1177/1066480713505072>

Landor M, Kennedy H. (2011). *Video interaction guidance: a relationship-based intervention to promote attunement, empathy and wellbeing*, London, Jessica Kingsley Publishers.

Vizard E, Gray J, Bentovim A. (2022). The impact of child maltreatment on the mental and physical health of child victims: a review of the evidence. *BJPsych Advances*. 28(1): 60-70. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1192/bja.2021.10>

Date of search:

March 2022

Concepts used:

video and (guidance or interaction or feedback); VIG; parent*; child*